The Physiological and Health consequences of HIV Stigma

A public health crisis

Andrew Clark

Disclosures

• Employed by ViiV Healthcare

Social factors impact on infections

- Poor outcomes for many infections are associated with homelessness and poverty, notably HCV, HIV and more recently COVID-19
- Social factors are intrinsic to immune health and social adversity, particularly amongst the socially excluded with demonstrable impact on;
 - Immune dysfunction
 - Morbidity and mortality including in PWH
 - Women appear more profoundly impacted than men

Coronavirus deaths higher in England's poorest communities



The Index of Multiple Deprivation ranks English areas from most deprived (1) to least deprived (10)

Adapted from Office for National Statistics. Available at:

https://www.ons.gov.uk/people population and community/health and social care/conditions and diseases/articles/coronavirus covid 192020 include the second second

harts/2020-12-18. Accessed April 2022

Stigma creates barriers to HIV care

Stigma creates barriers across the HIV prevention and care continuums

deterring HIV testing and knowing one's HIV status

hindering access to

optimal treatment preventive care services crucial for ending the epidemic



CDC and the WHO recognize societal stigma as a public health priority because of its adverse effects on effective prevention, treatment of diseases and its potential to accelerate disease processes

WHO adopted Goal 16 of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development which encourages inclusive societies that promote non-discrimination Counter negative consequences of stigma which make stigmatized populations more susceptible

chronic disease and mortality

Suffering

delayed treatment

declines in daily activities

unfair access to health insurance and appropriate medical care

HIV stigma is prevalent across 64 low/middle income countries



FIGURE 1 Map of prevalence estimates of stigma towards people with HIV among the population aged 15–49 years. Latest available data from 2015 to 2021. *Note*: High-income countries per the World Bank country income classification as of 2021.

large cross-sectional study of ~ 1.2 million individuals in 64 low- and middle-income countries

HIV stigma prevalent across all countries and > 10% of WHO target for 2030

Level of HIV public stigma was associated with sociodemographic characteristics.

- Disadvantaged individuals with lower educational level and wealth
- Women and adolescents

Associated with lower HIV testing uptake

HIV stigma is common across 64 low/middle income countries representing >1.6 billion people

- Public HIV stigma is broadly prevalent >10% in all 64 countries
 - 13% in Rwanda
 - 91% in Samoa,
 - average prevalence of 44%
- WHO Global Sector's target for 2025/2030 for the percentage of people living with HIV who experience HIV-related stigma is <10%
- Consistent dose–response effect on public HIV stigma by both individuallevel and country-level socioeconomic status with lower income and education levels linked to higher stigma
- Public HIV stigma was associated with lower levels of HIV testing, when examining both lifetime testing as well as testing in the past year

Prevalence estimates of stigma towards people living with HIV



FIGURE 2 Prevalence estimates and 95% confidence intervals (CIs) of stigma towards people with HIV among the population aged 15– 49 years. Latest available data from 2015 to 2021. PDR, People's Democratic Republic. *Note*: *The sample only included women. **The sample only included ever-married women and men.

HIV CRIMINISALATION ACROSS GLOBE



Adapted from HIV justice network 2021. Available at: https://www.hivjustice.net/wp-content/uploads/2021/06/HJN-Strategic-Plan-2022-26.final_.pdf. Accessed April 2022

Ever used criminal law, but not since 2017 (n=20)

Current or proposed HIVspecific criminal or similar law (n=60)

Reported cases since 2017 using any kind of criminal or similar law (n=50)

COUNTRIES with LAWs DisCRiminating Against HIv

HIV justice network Audit – 1/10/15 and 31/12/2018

- Globally, laws used for HIV criminalisation are often written or applied based on myths and misconceptions about HIV and its modes of transmission
- Significant proportion of prosecutions for acts that constitute no or very little risk of HIV transmission
- eg vaginal and anal sex when condoms had been used/ or the person with HIV had a low viral load /oral sex/single acts of Adapted from. HIV Justice Network 2019. Available at: https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scratching.or
 content/uploads/ft0/pg/05/AHJ3-Full-Report-English-Eigel pdf //docosod April 2022



Anti-Same-sex Laws remain in ~70 countries with variable definitions and

LEGAL SANCTIONS AGAINST SAME-SEX CONDUCT VARY IN SCOPE AND APPLICATION



expression that target transgender and gender nonconforming people.

despite a 2003 Supreme Court decision that found such laws unconstitutional.

RUSSIA AND LITHUANIA

do not criminalize same-sex acts or forms of gender expression, but they prohibit "propaganda" in support of LGBT rights, to silence activists. Many other countries have erected <u>barriers to freedom of association and assembly</u> for LGBT groups Adapted from Human Rights Watch. Available at: http://internap.hrw.org/features/features/lgbt_laws/.

Accessed April 2022

Hiv Stigma and discrimination Are prevalent in the healthcare setting across all regions



Adapted from Castel AD. Available at: https://vdocument.in/the-90-90-90-goals-and-fast-track-cities-a-success-relationships-socialinclusion.html?page=28. Accessed April 2022 Respondents Experiencing Stigma and/or Discrimination By A Healthcare Facility Or Healthcare Worker



DRIVERS OF HIV RELATED STIGMA FROM HEALTHCARE WORKERS

Lack of awareness

 Healthcare workers may be unaware that their attitudes, words & actions are stigmatizing

Moral judgement

- Healthcare workers may make negative judgements about people who are "different"
- / May not understand the lives, identities & sexuality of key populations vulnerable to HIV
- MSM, transgender individuals, sex workers & PWUD may be seen as sinful or immoral, thus deserving of shame & blame

Fear & ignorance

- / Healthcare workers may lack knowledge about & have misconceptions about HIV transmission & fear acquiring HIV through casual contact or medical procedures
- / Such fear & ignorance drives stigma

Religion Ideology

/ Personal and Cultural ideology of Healthcare Workers, that may impact their care of patients

Adapted from IAPAC 2018. Fast track cities. Available at: https://www.fast-trackcities.org/hiv-stigma. Accessed April 2022



HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS ARE COMMON IN HEALTH SETTINGS:

/ Ubiquitous in healthcare settings

/ Limiting or denying access to quality health services for specific populations

HIV SEROPOSITIVE HEALTH CARE WORKERS FACE DISCRIMINATION

HUMAN RIGHTS AND HEALTH – A FUNDAMENTAL RIGHT OFTEN VIOLATED BY HIV HEALTHCARE DELIVERY

/ From co – workers and employers

/ Limitations to their roles – not allowed to work in settings/ opportunities are limited

/ Live in environments where their occupational rights, responsibilities and roles are not recognised or respected

HEALTH CARE WORKERS WHO TREAT HIV FACE LIMITATIONS TO THEIR PRACTICE

/ Health care professionals working in clinics or hospitals treating PLHIV face discrimination and limitations on their work may be limited eg seen or treated differently

HUMAN RIGHTS VIOLATIONS OCCUR IN HEALTHCARE SETTINGS EVERYWHERE

/ Coercion of patients

/ Substandard and lack of quality of care

/ Breaches of confidentiality

Adapted from IAPAC. Available at: https://www.fast-trackcities.org/hiv-stigma. Accessed April 2022; UNAIDS 2017. Available at: https://www.unaids.org/sites/default/files/media_asset/2017ZeroDiscriminationHealthCare.pdf. Accessed April 2022

Social determinants of health



Adapted from Kaise Family Foundation. Available at: https://www.kff.org/policy-watch/health-disparities-symptombroader-social-economic-inequities. Accessed April 2022

Sensing Adversity

'FLIGHT OR FIGHT' threat vigilance

Diverse Stigmas Trigger Stress Response



Social safety determinants and consequences for stigmatised populations



Diamond 2022

Social Safety impacts multiple domains of functioning



People Living with HIV Experience and Respond to Social Stigma Through HIV-related Stigma Mechanisms: Impacts Health Outcomes



Social and political identities combine to create unique modes of discrimination and privilege leading to multiple discredited social identities for people living with HIV



Chronic Inflammation Secondary to Long-term Stress Manifests as Immune Dysfunction



META – ANALYSIS: HIV STIGMA IS ASSOCIATED WITH LOWER PHYSICAL HEALTH

Univariate Results	Statistics for Each Study					
	Correlation	Lower Limit	Upper limit	Z-Value	p-Value	
Miles (1997)	-0.390	-0.596	-0.136	-2.941	0.003	
Bozarth (1998)	-0.510	-0.703	-0.248	-3.559	0.000	
Demi (1998)	-0.290	-0.408	-0.162	-4.337	0.000	
Reece (2001)	-0.450	-0.577	-0.302	-5.505	0.000	
Heckman (2002)	-0.220	-0.416	-0.005	-2.000	0.045	
Sayles (2008)	-0.140	-0.273	-0.002	-1.988	0.047	
Kalichman Cape Town (2009)	-0.050	-0.110	0.010	-1.633	0.102	
Kalichman Swaziland (2009)	-0.180	-0.237	-0.122	-6.000	0.000	
Kalichman Atlanta (2009)	-0.120	-0.249	0.013	-1.772	0.076	
Grov (2010)	-0.090	-0.154	-0.025	-2.724	0.006	
Nyamathi (2013)	-0.210	-0.427	0.030	-1.719	0.086	
Sumari-de Boer (2012)	-0.008	-0.020	0.003	-1.418	0.156	
Summary measure	-0.190	-0.264	-0.113	-4.798	0.000	

Univariate Results		Statistics for Each Study			
	Correlation	Lower Limit	Upper limit	Z-Value	p-Value
Tam Van (2012)	-0.360	-0.468	-0.241	-5.653	0.000
Newman (2012)	-0.160	-0.284	-0.027	-2.361	0.018
Summary measure	-0.263	-0.447	-0.058	-2.503	0.012
Multivariate Results					
Slater (2013)	-0.210	-0.367	-0.053	-2.625	-0.009
Vyavaharkar (2012)	-0.260	-0.378	-0.142	-4.333	0.000
Abboud (2010)	-21.510	-35.387	-7.633	-3.038	0.002
Summary measure	-0.245	-0.526	0.037	-1.702	0.089



Correlation and 95% CI





Adapted from Rueda S et al. BMJ Open 2016;6:e011453

23

Social Stress is associated with an ageing immune phenotype

Lifetime exposure to stressful conditions is a known risk factor for poor health, increasing the risk for early onset of age-related disease and premature death





- / National sample of >5000 older US adults found that exposure to social stress was associated with T cell distributions indicative of accelerated immune aging*
- / Life trauma and chronic stress associated with ↓% CD4+ naïve T cells
- / Everyday discrimination, lifetime discrimination, and chronic stress were associated with an ↑% of terminally differentiated CD4+ T cells
- / Stressful life events, lifetime discrimination and life trauma associated with a ↓% of CD8+ naïve T cells,
- / Stressful life events, lifetime discrimination, and chronic stress significantly associated with an ↑% of terminally differentiated CD8+ T cells
- / Lifetime discrimination and chronic stress were associated with lower CD4:CD8 ratio

Immune aging is associated with chronic diseases: cancer and cardiovascular disease, weakened response to acute infections, increased risk of pneumonia, reduced efficacy of vaccines and organ system ageing

Sexual minority stress correlates with multiple inflammationassociated diseases

Cytokines affect the activity of the two biological systems that are most associated with the pathophysiology of depression:

Lesbian, gay, and bisexual people raised in hostile environments where minority sexual orientations are highly stigmatized show blunted cortisol responses to social stress

Chronic stress induces glucocorticoid resistance with failure to downregulate inflammation and impaired response to viral challenge

Stress exposure: triggers changes in the immune system, neurotransmitters, neuroendocrine system and central nervous system

- ↓ IFN-response genes
- ↓ immune response to novel pathogens
- Cytokines mediate depression

Flenje 2018: Jeon S et al. 2016;,



Sexual minority men (vs heterosexual) demonstrate increased pre-clinical of risk for negative health outcomes:

- ↑C-reactive protein
- ↑ diastolic blood
- faster heart rate
- hypertension

Sexual minority stress is related to differential expression of individual genes and pathways in leukocytes that are implicated in inflammation, immune function, cancer, and cardiovascular function

Thirty-eight men living with HIV with minority stress had RNA sequenced vs 23 participants lacking minority stress 90 genes were differentially expressed at an FDR of 0.10. 69 upregulated and 21 downregulated

41 differentially expressed genes, 35 2-directionally perturbed pathways functionally related to mechanisms of inflammation, cancer, immune function, and cardiovascular function

7 genes and 16 pathways related to inflammation or immune functioning were differentially expressed between low and high minority stress groups.

BTLA, whose proteins are associated with homeostasis of inflammatory responses within cells KLRB1, which inhibits natural killer cell cytotoxicity

CD69, which has a role in the regulation of immune function and inflammation

32 differentially expressed genes and 8 perturbed pathways were related to cancer

neuroactive ligand receptor interaction pathway

expression of ZNF426 (role of autonomic nervous system activity in the reactivation of Kaposi's sarcoma associated herpes virus)

Multiple Interactions Between Pathways Provide Evidence of a Complex Pathogenesis Model for Depression

Cytokine production is activated by stress and sympathetic nerve system activation

Cytokines act via 3 pathways

/ Neurotransmitter depletion

/ Neuroendocrine

/ Neural plasticity



5-HT: Serotonin; BDNF: Brain derived neurotrophic factor GR: Glucocorticoid receptor; IDO: Indoleamine-2,3-dioxygenase; NMDA: N-methyl-D-aspartate

PTSD and cytokine dysregulation

Cytokine signature differs by gender

Dalgard Translational Psychiatry (2017), 1-11

Intrinsically low levels of circulating cortisol

Excessive levels of cell-mediated and proinflammatory cytokine expression

co-morbid with MDD have higher levels of serum IL-6

Several other individual cytokines and chemokines were significantly different in the PTSD 0900 hours plasmas compared with healthy control plasma, IL-1 β + two-fold; TNF α ↑ca.64%; IP-10 ↑ ca. 50%

Elevated chemokine MCP-4 (monocyte chemoattractant protein-4; CCL11) and reduced chemokine MCP-1 (monocyte chemoattractant protein-1; CCL2) significantly distinguish PTSD subjects from healthy controls

MCP-4/MCP-1 ratio was found to be a significantly elevated, genderindependent, biomarker for PTSD over the entire circadian period Chemokines also distinguish PTSD patients from healthy controls on the basis of gender over the circadian period

MCP-4 and MIP-1 β (monocyte interacting protein 1 β ;CCL4) to significantly biomark PTSD in females

MCP-1 and the lymphokine TARC (thymus and activation-regulated chemokine; CCL17) significantly biomarks PTSD in males;

Stigma is associated with Cardiovascular disease

Both acute and chronic stress influence cardiovascular function

Acute stress induces 'fight or flight' response

↑heart rate

 \uparrow blood pressure

secretion of stress hormones (e.g., adrenaline, noradrenaline, and cortisol)

Chronic stress induces sustained sympathetic nervous system stimulation

Sustained elevated heart rate and blood pressure

Endothelial dysfunction with vasoconstriction

Atherosclerosis

Arrhythmias due to ↑ in pro-arrhythmogenic potential

Increased risk for thrombosis (platelet activation, haemostatic changes haemocentration Stigma and CVD in the literature: The current evidence implies an association between perceived discrimination and cardiovascular health

Review including 84 studies over 31 years to 2017

Studies categorized according to demonstrated links between stigma and cardiovascular disease risk factors

Blood pressure n = 45

Heart rate variability n = 6

Blood/saliva CV biomarkers n=18

Other indicators of cardiovascular health n = 15

86% concluded that there was a significant relationship among stigma or discrimination and cardiovascular health indicators among socially stigmatized groups

Varying degrees of evidence supporting these relationships, depending on the type of discrimination and cardiovascular health indicator

IMPACT OF HIV STIGMA ON OLDER PEOPLE LIVING WITH HIV



Tailored interventions for older people living with HIV

Adapted from Short D et al. AIDS 2020; abstr OAD0903.2; Marcus JL et al. CROI 2020; abstr 151. 2; Marcus JL et al. J Acquir Immune Defic Syndr 2016;73:39–46.

Stigma in older people living with HiV

DIRECT ADVERSE HEALTH EFFECTS

DIRECT ADVERSE ENVIRONMENTAL FACTORS

Stress response

Chronic inflammation



Comorbidities





Mental health: / Neuropsychiatric / Neuroendocrine effects **HCP discrimination and bias**

Impact on health seeking behaviour and adherence to ARVs

Societal factors:

/ Criminalisation of HIV religion/faith, isolation

/ Barriers to accessing PrEP

/ Impact of COVID-19 pandemic

/ Socioeconomic effect

STIGMA IN OLDER PEOPLE LIVING WITH HIV

- / For older adults, the fear of stigma was related to concerns about **rejection and social isolation** as people limit social contacts
- / Older people living with HIV often reported high rates of depression
- / 39% of older people living with HIV had major depression related to loneliness and stigma
- / Concurrent drug use among older people living with HIV is higher than their non-HIV counterparts and was associated with increased rates of mental health and medical problems

Adapted from: Siegel K *et al. J Pain Symptom Manage* 2010;40:353–69; Grov C *et al. AIDS Care* 2010;22:630–9; Green TC *et al. Drug Alcohol Depend* 2010;110:208–20 Adapted from Wilson RS *et al. Arch Gen Psychiatry* 2007;64:234–40; Holt-Lundstad J *et al. PLoS Med* 2010;7 e1000316; Holt-Lundstad J *et al. Perspect Psychol Sci* 2015;10:227–37; Valtorta NK *et al. Heart* 2016;102:1009–16



HIV-Related Stigma is significantly associated with Multidimensional Frailty Among Older Latinos With HIV

HIV-related stigma is a stressor for Latino people with HIV and an important barrier to HIV care

The association between **HIV-related stigma** and **multidimensional frailty** among Latino PWH aged >50 was evaluated in a cross-sectional design with 120 Latino PWH

- Self-reported questionnaires to assess multidimensional frailty*
- HIV-related stigma (HIV stigma scale)

Participants:

- 59.1 ± 7.0 years old,
- primarily White-Hispanic (85.00%, n = 102),
- single (48.33%, *n* = 58)
- male (73.30%, *n* = 88)

Nearly half of the participants were **frail** (45.85%, *n* = 55)

Frail individuals (vs non-frail) had

- significantly higher scores in the total HIV-related stigma (M = 98.5 ± 24.7 vs. M = 85.3 ± 25.6, p = .020) and all subscales.
- multidimensional frailty were 1.021 times higher for people with higher HIV-related stigma scores (p = .007) significant after adjustment for income and comorbidities (p = .049)

*Tilburg Frailty Indicator

Efforts to prevent multidimensional frailty should consider addressing HIV-related stigma through age-appropriate and culturally tailored resources for this group

CONSEQUENCES OF POOR ADHERENCE









RISK OF EMERGENT DRUG RESISTANCE⁴

VIRAL FAILURE¹

Missed Clinic

APPOINTMENTS²

DECREASED QOL³

CLINICAL PROGRESSION OF DISEASE⁵



INCREASED HOSPITALIZATION RATES⁶

iNCREASED MORBIDITY⁴

Transmission Disease progression

Poor management of comorbidities Loss of viral control

Neuropsychiatric disorders Isolation

Reduced treatment options Increasingly complex ART

/ Increasingly complex management / Poor QoL

/ Increased cost of care / Poor QoL

Multiple comorbidities and risk of DDIs Increased HCP exposure Poor QoL and increased risk of mortality

QOL, quality of life; ART, antiretroviral therapy

4. Nachega JB *et al. Infect Disord Drug Targets* 2011;11:167–74 5. Lucas GM. *J Antimicrob Chemother* 2005:55:413–16 6. Sax PE *et al. Plos One* 2012;7:e31591

Sumari-de Boer IM *et al. AIDS Behav* 2012;16:1681–89
Horstmann E *et al. Clin Infect Dis* 2010;50:752–61
de Oliveira e Silva AC *et al. Rev Lat Am Enfermagem* 2014;22:994–1000

STIGMA IS A BARRIER TO ART ADHERENCE WITH CONSEQUENT VIROLOGICAL FAILURE

- / Meta-analysis of 125 studies
- / Included:
 - / 17,061 adults
 - / 1099 children
 - / 856 adolescents
- / 13.6% of adults across studies listed stigma as a barrier to ART adherence
- / Higher risk of virological failure with worse adherence

Barrier		Percentage reporting barrier (95% CI)	Studies	Patients
Forgot	-•-	41.40 (37.30, 45.40)	80	13589
Travel		30.40 (25.50, 35.20	61	10955
Busy	— •—	29.40 (23.10, 35.70	56	10079
Change to routine	_	28.00 (20.90, 35.00)	25	4974
Asleep		24.80 (20.10, 29.60	36	6924
Avoid side effects	_	19.10 (15.40, 22.80)	36	6277
Toxicity		18.80 (15.90, 21.60)	59	10375
Ran out of pills	-	18.60 (15.70, 21.50)	44	6782
Problem at time	—• —	18.30 (13.40, 23.30)	24	4501
Distance to clinic	_	17.50 (13.00, 21.90)	14	3586
Stock outs	_	16.10 (11.70, 20.40)	13	3377
Sick		15.90 (13.00, 18.80)	43	7058
Depressed/ overwhelmed	-	15.50 (12.80, 18.30)	38	6790
Pill burden	-	13.60 (11.00, 16.30)	45	7160
Secrecy/stigma	•	13.60 (11.90, 15.30)	57	9950
Alcohol/substance misuse	-	12.90 (9.70, 16.10)	21	3450
Lack of food	—• —	12.60 (6.50, 18.70)	11	2992
Palatability	— •	11.80 (6.30, 17.20)	6	866
Felt good		9.30 (7.20, 11.40)	28	5884
	0 10 20 30 40 50	60 70		

Socially Excluded People Living With HIV Have Lower CD4 counts and Worse Outcomes

Factors influencing CD4 count and outcomes of socially excluded people living with HIV can include:



Systematic review and meta-analysis1

- / Food-insecure people had 1.32 times greater odds of having lower CD4 counts compared to foodsecure people (OR = 1.32, 95% CI: 1.15, 1.53)
- / Food-insecure people had on average 91 fewer CD4 cells/µl compared to their food secure counterparts (mean difference:-91.09; 95% CI: -156.16, -26.02)

Multivariate logistic regression models for factors affecting CD4 counts among people living with HIV in Guangxi, N=11983



 People living with HIV with high socioeconomic status (SES) were more likely to have higher CD4 counts (adjusted OR: 1.44, 95%CI: 1.08, 1.91) than people with low SES, after adjusting for potential confounders



HIV infected individuals on ART in Victoria 1996 – 2008 Kaplan-Meier estimates by injecting status²



/ Older age, low initial CD4 cell count (<200/mm³), ever having a CD4 count <200/mm³ (before or during treatment) and high initial viral load (>5 log₁₀) were associated with increased risk of AIDS and death

Adapted from Aibibula W *et al. AIDS Care* 2016;28:1577–85
Adapted from Walsh N *et al. BMC Infect Dis* 2014;14:707
Adapted from Yang X *et al. AIDS Care* 2021;33:347–51

Stigma induces chronic inflammation and inflammationassociated diseases via 2 major pathways

Minority stress (chronic cumulative) associated with Stigma

Repeated exposure overwhelms individual's stress response systems ↑ vulnerability to stress-related health problems

↑ allostatic load: cumulative psychological and biological toll of stress

↑ autonomic and Hypothalamicpituitary-adrenal activity

↑ health disparities vs nonstigmatised

- Depression
- Anxiety
- Suicide
- Cardiovascular disease
- Diabetes
- Hypertension
- Arthritis
- Cancer



Human neurobiological default state is threat-vigilance

Social safety is an essential human need at all stages of life

- Reliable social connection
- Social belonging
- Social inclusion
- Social recognition
- Social protection

Insufficient social safety activates neuroimmune pathways of selfperseverance

- Isolation
- Restricted activity
- Concealment
- Defensive aggression
- self-harm
- Inflammation and associated disease

To reduce health disparities in stigmatised populations, both reductions in stressors and amplification of social safety are required

'INCLUDE'... FOSTERING A STIGMA FREE ENVIRONMENT

INCLUDE

Key populations in healthcare service design and implementation

Stigma and discrimination reduction as a goal in national strategies

UNAIDS TERMINOLOGY GUIDELINES Talk openly about HIV and Stigma Choose supportive language that is not stigmatizing Speak out to correct myths and stereotypes

Educate yourself and others

STAND UP TO STIGMA

Adapted from UNAIDS terminology guidelines 2015

MUCHAS GRACIAS



